

## Guide to Best Practices in Faculty Retention - Draft Outline

### A note on organization:

Columbia University is committed to hiring and retaining diverse and talented faculty. Columbia is dedicated to removing any barriers that may limit the opportunities for advancement of qualified members of underrepresented groups. This guide is intended to help Department Chairs fulfill the University's commitment to diversity and inclusion through best practices found to help retain faculty. Diversity includes but is not limited to dimensions of dis/ability, gender, gender identity and expression, national origin, race/ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, socioeconomic status and veteran status.

The practices and strategies listed in this document were informed by case study reviews of best practices proven effective at several peer institutions; literature review of studies regarding barriers to the retention of faculty, particularly faculty of color and other underrepresented groups; faculty experiences at Columbia; and an examination of best practices across Columbia.

Regarding barriers to retention, Gasman, Kim and Nguyen (2011) found the following to be leading causes for dissatisfaction and leave among faculty; racial and social isolation, lack of mentoring, occupational stress, devaluation of "minority" research, the "token hire" misconception of underrepresented faculty, and biases in tenure and promotion evaluations. The practices included in this guide are intended to specifically target these barriers to retention.

This guide begins with a **Checklist**, a summary of best practices to improve and sustain retention of faculty. Best practices are organized into categories, the first category is **Data on Health and Welfare of Departments** which lists strategies a Department Chair can use to monitor the health and welfare of their department. Next, is the section on **Culture and Climate**, which describes elements of an inclusive climate and how Department Chairs can ensure they promote an inclusive culture within their departments. This guide uses the term "inclusive environment" to mean a climate that welcomes and values difference of background, race, expertise, gender, sexuality, and religion among its faculty. The sections following Culture and Climate are **Leadership Development** and **Professional Development**. These two sections list opportunities Department Chairs can help create for faculty to develop leadership skills and further their careers. *Each section includes some of the best practices currently used across schools at Columbia.* The guide presents **Scenarios** in which the strategies developed in earlier sections can be used to guide Department Chairs in their conversations with faculty members as they deal with leaves of absence, counter offers or tenure promotions. Lastly, the guide offers Department Chairs a table of **Indicators of Success** of best practices they can refer to as they work to support faculty, a **Barriers to Retention Table** that organizes best practices by the retention barrier it is structured to address, and **Retention Practices by Faculty Stage** table which outlines the most appropriate strategies a Department Chair could use to support a

faculty member at each stage of their career.

This guide is written as a living document; in that spirit, we invite feedback on what works, what doesn't, and what should be added.

## CHECKLIST:

### Establish Supportive and Welcoming Climate

- Communicate department policies and expectations clearly and early
- Create opportunities for faculty to participate in department and school governance
- Establish and promote mentoring for faculty
- Connect faculty to campus resources both within and outside the department
- Facilitate networking opportunities for faculty
- Consider leaves and other policies on an individual basis to best meet faculty needs

### Support Faculty Professional Development

- Celebrate and recognize diverse contributions and outstanding performance
- Encourage faculty to pursue research and intellectual interests
- Provide all faculty with training in cultural sensitivity and responsiveness
- Support faculty development for continued improvement in teaching practices

### Monitor Departmental Health

- Meet with faculty regularly to provide and receive feedback
- Conduct surveys to measure job satisfaction
- Monitor course and service commitments to ensure faculty have feasible workloads
- Examine data for faculty appointments, promotions and resignations for any disparities
- Review decision making processes checking for any biases

## DATA ON THE HEALTH AND WELFARE OF DEPARTMENTS

Monitoring the health and welfare of departments serves to check for systemic biases and inequities that can be proactively addressed to ensure equal treatment of all faculty. Collecting and analyzing department data regularly allow Department Chairs to learn about what is working well and what needs to improve. The following are some tools that can help Department Chairs determine the health and welfare of their departments:

### 1. *State of the Department Reviews (bi-annual)*

These reviews are a systematic and carefully reviewed processes that allow Department Chairs to identify and address any disparities in the allocation of resources and opportunities.

Among the resources Department Chairs should monitor the allocation and distribution of are the following;

- a. Teaching assistants
- b. Research assistants
- c. Time for research
- d. Adequate funding
  - i. Travel funds, discretionary funds
- e. Clerical/administrative support
- f. Lab space and equipment

During these reviews, Department Chairs can evaluate faculty performance, recognize good work, review salaries and benefits to ensure that salaries are equitably and adequately distributed, commensurate to faculty experience and achievement, and considerate of the cost of living in New York, which may be higher than other places. .

#### **Other Institutions:**

University of Washington: Sees state of the department reviews as an opportunity for departments to take proactive steps instead of reactive steps to retain faculty. The reviews are a tool to regularly adjust salaries in cases of inequity and to reward and recognize excellent work.

#### **Practice Highlight:**

For Department Chairs interested in learning more about state of the department reviews, guidance and support is available through the Vice Provost Offices for Faculty Diversity and Inclusion and Office for Faculty Affairs.

### 2. *Exit Interviews of faculty leaving Columbia*

Exit interviews provide insight into why faculty decide to leave, and can help departments revise their practices to improve retention. The goal, however, is to prevent these meetings by having structures in place that check for faculty satisfaction regularly, so that measures could be taken preemptively. As appropriate, the Department Chairs or a senior member of the faculty or administration, should leave these conversations with an action plan to prevent future exits from the department. In addition to exit interviews, Parker (2006) suggests that Department Chairs collect qualitative data on why faculty decide to stay at the institution in order to learn more about what is working well.

### 3. *Bi-annual surveys measuring job satisfaction and expectations (re COACHE)*

Department Chairs should meet with faculty regularly to check in, and provide support as needed. These regular “check-ins” provide department leaders with insight into the health of the department, provide personal attention and help faculty feel heard and supported.

Surveys can be issued electronically to faculty 2-4 times an academic year. They can go out at the end of each term, or at both the beginning and end of each term. The surveys will measure job satisfaction, and can be tailored to the different stages in a faculty’s career. Surveys are low-entry tools that collect information, and make data analysis easier. The Stanford University Retention Guide suggests that departments collect data regularly through surveys and focus groups, and that this data be disaggregated to allow for departments to measure job satisfaction by race or ethnicity, gender, time at the university, or role at the institution [Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education \(COACHE\)](#) has developed a survey to help institutions learn about faculty job satisfaction and take action to improve climate in order to support and retain faculty. The surveys are tailored to institutional needs and help institutions answer the following questions:

- How do faculty of different career stages experience academic work life at my institution?
- How do their experiences compare to those of faculty at peer institutions?
- Do their experiences differ by rank, tenure status, discipline, gender, or race/ethnicity?
- What policies or practices are associated with high levels of faculty satisfaction and vitality?

### 4. *Monitor Faculty Workload*

Manageable workloads are important to faculty at all stages of their career, but a burdensome workload can be particularly tolling on new faculty who are still finding their footing in their new position. Demands on faculty time can be particularly draining when faculty feel they spend more time doing “administrative tasks” concerning reimbursements, securing adequate work space, managing travel, , among other

logistical tasks. Some junior faculty described the drain on their time as follows;

“The things that are bogging me down are the administrative stuff. It took me a long time to get into my space”

When faculty feel supported and welcomed, their transition into their jobs is more seamless. A Columbia junior faculty member describes their experience as follows:

“My department was very good at communicating with me as far as the equipment that I wanted and the classes that I wanted to teach. I felt like I knew the people by name via email. My office was set up – no issues.”

Creating a supportive and welcoming environment benefits all faculty; however Department Chairs should also consider the particular challenges that members of underrepresented groups face. Gasman, Kim and Nguyen (2011) identified isolation, and misconceptions of being the “token” figure in a department as barriers to retaining diverse faculty. Women and underrepresented minorities are often asked to serve on several committees, mentor students and other faculty. While these service commitments are important to both faculty and departments, Museus, Ledesma and Parker (2015) suggest they are not considered as important when evaluating faculty for promotion or tenure. Too many service commitments can interfere with research and publications, which are more heavily weighed in the tenure and promotion process. They argue that this places underrepresented and female faculty at a disadvantage. Misra (2016) suggests that universities should not only monitor service commitments to ensure that faculty are all pulling their weight, but also value and recognize teaching, advising and service responsibilities when evaluating a faculty member for promotion. Department Chairs must ensure that underrepresented minorities are not overburdened with responsibilities of being the “token” member of an underrepresented group. The following excerpt reflects the experience of a faculty member who became a token figure for their department;

"I became the person who had a baby and everyone wanted to know what it was like...a responsibility to be setting expectations for future women coming through the department. There is already a burden associated with women going through the tenure process – this makes it a double burden. "

##### 5. *Monitor Decision making processes Departmental Climate and Culture*

Department Chairs should also check for behaviors or norms in the department that may create a hostile or unwelcoming environment for new faculty members. It is important for Department Chairs to be reflective of their role as allies to underrepresented faculty. Rockquemore (2016) advises Department Chairs to ask

themselves the following questions;

- A. Am I truly behaving as an ally?
- B. Am I prepared to deal with microaggressions and fully support underrepresented faculty?
- C. Are there structures in place to support newly recruited faculty? Underrepresented faculty?

This reflection should be accompanied by an action plan to ensure that both leaders and faculty are adequately prepared to work in a way that is inclusive and welcomes diversity. Reflective processes and structures that welcome feedback all work to help departments create inclusive and warm climates that support faculty.

## DEPARTMENT CLIMATE AND CULTURE

Inclusive, warm, and supportive environments improve faculty retention. Creating a welcoming department climate can prevent feelings of isolation among faculty, help faculty feel valued, lead to productive research collaboration, and willingness to buy into the department decision-making process. An inclusive culture is one in which individuals, their perspectives and experiences are respected and valued. Though departments share the responsibility of creating inclusive cultures, Department Chairs, as leaders, can establish policies and practices that facilitate and promote that kind of culture. What follows are some suggested strategies to ensure that the message faculty receive is one of inclusion.

1. Department Chairs should ensure that there is **transparency** in the way decisions for tenure, and promotions are made. Department Chairs should make tenure and promotion guidelines, HR policies, and administrative procedures available and accessible to everyone on staff early and often. Department Chairs should be knowledgeable about the university's policies concerning leaves, accommodations, and connect faculty to the administrative offices with expertise and knowledge in those areas. Whenever possible, Department Chairs should allow faculty to be involved in the decision-making process and governance.

Knowledge and awareness of university and department policies is particularly important for junior and new faculty as expressed by a junior faculty below:

“A bit of orientation would be good, especially to learn Columbia logistics and processes. Then you don't waste your time on things that are not going to work and avoid unnecessary missteps.”

Columbia offers a wide range of supports and resources for its faculty, and Department Chairs should be ready to connect their faculty these school or university-wide support networks available to them. Orientations for new faculty are a good starting point, but

fall privy to being “too much too soon” and are not enough to help new faculty acclimate to their new community. Moreover, finding support networks can be particularly challenging for underrepresented groups, so extra effort to help them get what they need is recommended.

Transparency also entails **accountability**. In order to build a trusting climate within departments, there must be follow-through on grievances and concerns.

**Practice Highlight:**

Columbia University Medical Center’s Office of Faculty Professional Development offers faculty a series of workshops and programs to guide them through the promotion and tenure process.

- Faculty Career Paths and Promotion Series covers topics ranging from overall strategies for faculty success at CUMC to a detailed outline of the promotion and tenure process at CUMC
  - Ask COAP Series provides faculty with the opportunity to ask the two chairs of the Committee of Appointments and Promotions (COAP) questions about the processes and timelines for promotions at CUMC. Ask COAP also partners with departments to host a clinic that gives faculty the opportunity to work in small groups with senior faculty to review CV’s in the context of criteria for academic tracks
2. Departments should be intentional in establishing opportunities for faculty to meet and interact both formally and informally. Junior faculty have expressed an interest and need for opportunities to meet with other faculty and establish supportive networks;

“It might be nice to have a venue for [] faculty to meet each other because it can be isolating. That’s something a lot of universities do. Is it important for my tenure? - Probably not, but it would be nice for my mental health. If Columbia were to send out, even if it were just to Arts & Sciences - cocktail hour for [] faculty and families. Come meet your peers. That sends a huge message that the University administration sees us as a legitimate community that is worth fostering.”

**Practice Highlight:**

The Columbia Center for Teaching and Learning (CTL) offers a number of ways for faculty to stay connected and build community on campus. CTL has department liaisons who help to keep the CTL informed about faculty and graduate students’ needs for programming and support, and share announcements of CTL programs and activities to colleagues in their departments.

The Vice Provost Office for Faculty Diversity and Inclusion, and Office of the Executive Vice President for Research host a series of faculty development sessions and social

events to help faculty connect with each other.

Columbia Engineering offers Junior Faculty Social Hours as an opportunity for faculty to meet and interact with each other.

3. Departments should establish **mentoring structures**. Mentors or a mentoring panel are more than just people to talk to; they are people who actively advocate and create opportunities for their mentees. Mentoring helps connect faculty to the community, and helps foster a warm and welcoming climate. Mentors are an invaluable resource to faculty who are learning to navigate the institution, need advice regarding their professional development, or simply need someone to go to for social and emotional support. Faculty in all stages of their careers can benefit from mentoring relationships. One Columbia junior faculty member described their mentoring experience as follows;

“My chair tells me what grants I should start applying for and in addition to that, I had my 1<sup>st</sup> year review. I don’t feel like I’m just showing up and doing my thing and they are doing theirs. They have integrated me into ongoing projects. I feel good about the mentoring and about the places that I can go to ask questions.”

-Columbia Junior Faculty Member

For more guidance in establishing a mentoring program, please refer to [Faculty Mentoring Best Practices Guide](#).

**Practice Highlight:**

Columbia University Medical Center hosts a series of workshops structured to help faculty develop as mentors. A wide range of topics are covered including the following;

- Career Mentorship: Find and Working Effectively With Mentors
- CVs and Insights: What You Need To Tell Your Story
- Mentorship and Mentor Training Workshop: Effective Communication, Setting Expectations, Support for Professional Development, and Mentoring Across Diversity

4. Valuing different paths to excellence and considering those to be as legitimate as traditional paths of scholarship is important for the retention and inclusion of underrepresented faculty. Museus, Ledesma and Parker (2015) state that minority faculty research is often regarded as less legitimate, especially if it relates to race. It is important for departments to respect and recognize the contributions of each faculty member. Department leaders should reward and recognize faculty work through;
  - A. Nominations for awards and recognitions
  - B. Open recognition of work during department meetings or personal check-ins

**Practice Highlight:**

Columbia shows its commitment to diversity and rewards faculty members who demonstrate that same commitment through their work and service.

Provost's Grant Program for Junior Faculty Who Contribute to the Diversity Goals of the University: The competitive program provides opportunities for junior faculty to thrive and ultimately achieve tenure. An average of 10 faculty members per year are each awarded a grant of up to \$25,000 to use for a project of their choosing.

Presidential Teaching Awards: Department Chairs, faculty and students can nominate faculty for this award in recognition of their outstanding performance and contributions to their field and department.

**Other institutions:**

Stanford University suggests that departments should reward faculty members for their productivity and contributions regardless of their mobility or interest in pursuing outside offers. As stated earlier, the strategies suggested in this guide are preemptive practices to create an inclusive and supportive environment that encourages faculty to remain at Columbia.

5. Creating an inclusive and supportive culture within departments includes establishing ***accommodating policies*** that best meet the needs of faculty. These accommodations serve to allow faculty to have a healthy work-life balance and include the following policies and practices;
  - a. Dual career accommodations
  - b. Flexible leave policies that help faculty balance their professional and personal responsibilities without negatively impacting their careers.

Policies regarding leaves are listed in the Faculty Handbook, and as stated before, should be made clear and available to all faculty.

Policies regarding leaves of absence should be reviewed on an individual basis within departments, and consider the different needs that faculty may have as they are dealing with life and career transitions. Ensuring that faculty know that a leave of absence will not negatively affect their career or ability to get tenure is important, especially for junior faculty and faculty from underrepresented groups who face a precedence of exclusion in their Institution.

**Practice Highlight:**

Columbia has developed a wide range of policies, programs, and services to assist faculty in meeting their family responsibilities while pursuing their careers. The [Faculty Handbook](#) outlines several of those resources. Department Chairs can also refer faculty

to the Associate Provost for Work/Life for more resources, some of which are listed below.

- [Parental Workload Relief program](#)
- [Dual Career Services](#)
- [Childcare Services](#)
- [Financial assistance programs for faculty caring for and educating their children](#)
- [Relocation assistance programs](#)
- [Higher Education Recruitment Consortium \(HERC\)](#)

Columbia Engineering offers faculty the following:

- Child Tuition Assistance Program for K-5 for children of faculty who reside in NYC
- Housing Assistance
- Parental Leave

**Other Institutions:**

In an effort to support and retain junior faculty members who face the challenge of working to establish academic careers while simultaneously managing significant caregiving responsibilities, the Office for Faculty Development at Duke University School of Medicine offers the Fund to Retain Clinical Scientists at Duke. Supported by an award from the Doris Duke Charitable Foundation and Dean Mary Klotman, the Fund will provide supplements of \$30,000-\$50,000 per year to physician-scientists with significant caregiving responsibilities.

## PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Among the factors that contribute to the advancement and retention of faculty is a climate that supports the professional development of faculty. Departments should provide faculty with opportunities for career development early and often, at every stage of their careers. Regular feedback is one way that Department Chairs can help support the professional development and advancement of faculty. Department Chairs provide regular and meaningful feedback to faculty during Chair-Faculty meetings. Feedback meetings should include time to brainstorm actionable steps faculty can take to improve, grow and develop. These meetings should also be reciprocal; where chairs are open to learn from faculty in their department. Other strategies to promote faculty professional development at every stage of their careers are listed below.

*Recently Recruited Faculty:*

- A. Departments should make coordinated efforts to help orient new faculty to the department. Professional development provides a venue through which faculty can learn about the various resources and benefits available to them. Professional development can also be targeted to provide faculty with the tools and skills necessary

to succeed at a new institution. At this stage faculty need guidance in establishing their research, hiring and managing research assistants, running research labs, mentoring students, and navigating the university. If relevant, additional effort should be made to help them situate their family members and integrate them into the university community. Columbia offers dual career services to assist the accompanying spouses/partners of newly recruited faculty with the challenges of conducting academic and non-academic job searches in a new location.

*Recently Tenured Faculty:*

- A. The University of Washington Faculty Retention Toolkit lists practices structured to encourage mid-career professional development. They define mid-career faculty as faculty who have been promoted from Assistant Professor to an Associate Professor with tenure. At this stage, departments should provide faculty with opportunities to be creative, and support them in the form of seed funding for new research directions, protective time for research, and mentors. While faculty at this stage are seemingly more settled in their roles at the university, faculty at all stages benefit from professional development. Recent studies show that after tenure, faculty experience increased dissatisfaction and disillusionment with their jobs, “associate professors are less satisfied than full professors and even than assistant professors, over whom the tenure broadsword still hovers.” (Monaghan, 2017). Monaghan goes on to explain that, “Disillusionment can often begin when stapled to the back of the tenure notification is a raft of service assignments, for instance. And studies have shown that women and minority faculty members are most overloaded with service chores, and often additional teaching duties, too, and that all new associates struggle to squeeze research into their schedules.” In light of these findings, it is essential that departments establish structures to continue supporting faculty through this transition, encouraging them to pursue their intellectual interests, monitoring their service and teaching commitments and allowing them to cut back on some duties. Professional development can be targeted to address a faculty member’s particular areas of growth, and provide them with the tools and skills they need to improve and succeed. These proactive programs can help connect faculty to their departmental community and invigorate faculty growth. Faculty development programs, benefits and resources is a strategy to connect faculty to resources that would help further their career development. Such opportunities can include the following;
  - a. Mid-career innovation grants
  - b. Encouraging creativity in faculty research and work
  - c. Guiding faculty through their track to tenure

*Senior Tenured Faculty:*

Senior faculty are established in their fields. Their scholarship, research and expertise are invaluable to our institution and often sought after by other universities. Stanford University suggests that departments, schools, and the university should provide appropriate support and

recognition of individual faculty members. Faculty members should be rewarded appropriately for their productivity and contributions regardless of their mobility or their interest in pursuing outside offers. Schools should strive to ensure that professors feel appropriately valued and to dispel perceptions that outside offers are the only way to gain rewards. Like faculty in other stages of their career, senior faculty can also benefit from continued professional development, leadership opportunities, research support, and opportunities to voice concerns and receive feedback.

**Practice Highlight:**

Schools across Columbia support faculty professional development through several programs, awards, workshops and resource centers. The following table highlights some of those practices.

| School or Department  | Trainings and Workshops  | Research and Other Resources  | Awards and Recognitions   |
|---|--|---|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Arts and Sciences</b></p> | <p>Orientation for Faculty New to Arts and Sciences at Columbia University</p> <p>A&amp;S Junior Faculty Career Development Conference (includes section of Faculty Review and Advancement to Tenure)</p> <p>New Department Chair Orientation</p> <p>Transition Meeting for Incoming and Outgoing Chairs</p> <p>Department Chair Workshop Series</p> <p>Faculty Search Committee</p> | <p>Junior Faculty Development Leave</p> <p>Chamberlain Fellowships</p> <p>The Tenured Faculty Research Program (TFRP)</p> <p>Lenfest Junior Faculty Development Grants</p> <p>Junior Faculty Summer Research Support Program for the Humanities and Social Sciences</p> | <p>Lionel Trilling Book Award</p> <p>Lenfest Distinguished Faculty Award</p> <p>Mark Van Doren Award for Teaching</p> <p>Fellowships for full-time faculty to serve as visiting faculty in affiliated institutions around the world</p> |

|  |  |   |  |
|--|--|---|--|
|  | <p>Briefings<br/>(includes section on Implicit Bias in Hiring and Review)<br/>Department Chair Workshop Series</p>   |   |  |
| <p><b>Columbia University<br/>Medical Center</b></p> | <p>The Office of Faculty Professional Development provides support and guidance to help faculty achieve productive and satisfying careers as researchers, teachers, clinicians, and academic administrators</p> <p>New Faculty Orientation</p> <p>Leadership and Management Institute</p> <p>Junior Faculty Development Series</p> <p>Summer Institute for Teaching and Learning Educator Mentorship</p> <p>Advancing Your Career as an Educator at CUMC</p> <p>Writing Letters of Recommendation for Students</p> <p>The CUMC Educator Clinic is a series of sessions to support the professional development of CUMC</p> | <p>K Award Workshop</p> <p>Grant Writing Workshops</p> <p>Funding and Grantsmanship Course</p> <p>Research Team Management Course</p> <p>NIH Grants Workshops</p> | <p>Awards granted in Commencement</p> <p>Dean's Distinguished Lecture in Clinical Sciences</p> |

|  |   |  |  |
|--|---|--|--|
|  | <p>faculty interested in teaching and learning</p> <p>Kenneth E. Forde<br/>Diversity Alliance<br/>Faculty Colloquium</p> <p>Virginia Kneeland<br/>Frantz Society for Women Faculty sponsors a series of programs to support women faculty</p> |  |  |
| <b>Mailman School of Public Health</b> | <p>New Faculty Orientation</p> <p>Teaching Workshops</p> <p>Office of Research Resources offers monthly seminars on a range of topics</p> <p>Comprehensive junior faculty mentoring program</p>   | <p>Office of Research Resources provides weekly funding opportunities and related notifications; offers individual assistance in identifying funding opportunities, grant prep and review services; and serves as liaison with SPA and IRB as needed</p> | <p>Calderone Junior Faculty prize to support research efforts</p> <p>Dean's Pilot Awards to support grant development</p> <p>Tow Awards to support mid-career faculty development</p> <p>Year-end Awards for faculty in teaching, mentoring and leadership</p> |
| <b>Columbia Business School</b>        |   | <p>Office of External Relations and Development supports faculty in securing external funds</p> <p>The Business school also offers faculty seed funding for research initiatives</p>   |  |
| <b>Columbia Engineering</b>            | New Faculty   | Provides faculty with  | Janette and Armen  |

|  |  |   |  |
|--|--|---|--|
|  | <p>Orientation for on-boarding and orienting new faculty to Columbia Engineering and Columbia University</p> | <p>information on external grants to fund research initiatives</p> <p>NYSTAR Faculty Development Program</p> <p>SEAS Interdisciplinary Research Seed (SIRS) Funding Program to fund new collaborative research</p> <p>SEAS Research Equipment Assistance Program (REAP) to encourage and support shared research equipment</p> <p>SEAS Translational Fellows Program - provides 20% of the salary of selected postdoctoral researchers or late stage doctoral students for one year to pursue commercialization of a technology that originated in SEAS research</p> <p>Celebration of faculty excellence</p> <p>Administrative and other support for outreach programs as needed for proposals and or interests of the faculty</p> <p>Support of freelance staff for preparation of larger proposals (graphics, collecting and</p> | <p>Avanessians Diversity Award recognizes outstanding performance of SEAS faculty in enhancing diversity in departmental, school and university programs at Columbia</p> <p>The Kim Award for Faculty Involvement recognizes a faculty member who has been exceptionally involved in the academic and co-curricular life of students in SEAS</p> <p>Provides a list of national awards that Department Chairs can nominate faculty for in recognition of outstanding performance</p> |
|--|--|---|--|

|  |   |  |  |
|--|---|--|--|
|  |   | <p>organizing inputs, budgets)</p> <p>Various research enhancement programs for junior faculty to focus on research</p>  |  |
| <b>Columbia Law</b>  | <p>Hosts a series of annual and semi-annual colloquia and workshops for faculty covering a range of topics and skills including how to create inclusive classrooms</p>  | <p>Summer research stipends to augment salary, contingent on continued productivity;</p> <p>Seed funding, distributed based on annual RFP processes, to support ambitious research projects and innovative teaching.</p> | <p>Willis Reese teaching prize, awarded annually for teaching excellence</p> <p>Rotating summer and academic year temporary research chairs.</p> |
| <b>School of International and Public Affairs</b>          | <p>Annual conferences covering a wide range of topics related to global policy initiatives</p>  | <p>Research Grants in Internet Policy and Cyber security</p> <p>Center on Global Energy Policy Faculty Grant Program</p> <p>SIPA Faculty Grants Program</p>  |  |
| <b>Columbia University's Learning and Development Team</b> | <p>Part of the Human Resources Department at Columbia, the Learning and Development Team provides in-person training workshops, customized programs and online learning resources for faculty and staff to help strengthen core professional skills</p> |  |  |
| <b>The Office of Executive</b>                             | <p>Promoting Credibility,</p>   | <p>Sponsors the Research</p>   |  |

|   |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|
| <p><b>Vice President for Research</b></p> | <p>Reproducibility and Integrity in Research Symposium</p> | <p>Initiatives in Science &amp; Engineering (RISE) funding competition, which awards seed monies to initiate groundbreaking, research. All full-time faculty-level researchers within the scientific and engineering disciplines are eligible to apply for this prestigious opportunity</p> <p>Provides faculty with the information necessary to pursue large center grants. The name of the organization, program, deadlines for applications, amount granted, time period for grant, frequency of award, and a brief description of the program are all included in this list</p> |  |
| <p><b>University-Wide</b></p>             |  | <p>President's Global Innovation Fund awards faculty with a venture fund to enable the development of projects across disciplinary and geographical lines</p> <p>The Office of Research Compliance and Training provides faculty with resources and support that help faculty secure competitive grants</p> <p>Columbia Technology Ventures</p>  | <p>Louisa Gross Horwitz Prize has been awarded by Columbia University for outstanding basic research in biology or biochemistry</p> <p>Great Teacher Award</p> |

|   |  |   |   |
|---|--|---|---|
|   |  | <p>Research Administration can help investigators learn about funding opportunities and apply for funding</p> <p>Data Science Institute<br/>ROADS Provost Ignition Grant</p>  |   |
| <p><b>The Columbia Center for Teaching and Learning</b></p> | <p>CTL offers The Hybrid Learning Course Redesign and Delivery grant program to support faculty who are developing innovative and technology-rich pedagogy and learning strategies in the classroom</p> <p>CTL offers a wide range of workshops to support faculty development and orientation for new faculty</p> | <p>CTL partners with faculty who have been awarded grants to innovate in their classroom or online environments to support faculty in bringing their projects to fruition</p> | <p>Provost's Hybrid Learning Course Redesign and Delivery Award</p> |

**LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT**

Leadership opportunities should be available to all faculty, particularly, workshops and professional development around diversity, being an ally, and creating an inclusive environment. (UT Austin Toolkit). Opportunities for leadership and the pursuit of special interests can be a way to recognize and reward outstanding performance. It is especially important for departments to establish opportunities for underrepresented faculty to develop their leadership and professional skills by providing faculty with the opportunity and support to participate in any of the following activities;

- Campus governance
- National conferences
- Leadership programs
- Research team management

## Practice Highlight:

A recent University-wide Task Force on Faculty Development identified leadership training opportunities for senior faculty as a key pathway to enhancing academic governance. To further enhance academic governance and increase the presence of female and underrepresented minority faculty in leadership positions, the Office of the Provost has established the Provost Leadership Fellows Program. The Fellows Program aims to develop leadership skills for our outstanding tenured faculty. Fellows engage directly with key campus strategic initiatives and academic processes in ways that are responsive to the Fellows' own professional development goals and interests. Over the two-year term, participants gain greater insight into academic initiatives, strategic planning, budget issues, and challenges in higher education.

Columbia University Medical Center offers faculty who currently have leadership/management responsibilities or who wish to include these in their career goals an annual Leadership and Management Course. The four day program helps participants develop knowledge and skills necessary for current and future leadership positions in the academic health sciences.

## SCENARIOS

1. *Counter Offer:* Faculty member comes to Department Chair with an offer from another institution.
  - Studies show that looking for outside offers is often a proxy for job dissatisfaction;
    - (Price, 1977) portrays turnover as a process that begins with a series of structural and individual determinants of job satisfaction
    - There is something about faculty work life or satisfaction that predisposes faculty to accept an offer from elsewhere
    - (Barnes et al, 1998) found that time constraints and commitment was an important predictor of a faculty member's desire to leave an institution
  - University of Washington Faculty Retention Guide states that the reactive strategy of waiting for faculty to bring in outside offers both lowers morale and encourages faculty to seek external employment opportunities. Counter offers should not be a faculty member's only way to get the attention of their Department Chair. Regular reviews and updates of salaries, benefits, job satisfaction, and workloads work to prevent faculty from seeking outside offers.
  - To improve working conditions for this faculty member a Department Chair can:
    - Offer a lighter teaching load
    - Consider an Exemption from Teaching Duties (ETD) for that faculty member (see Faculty Handbook for criteria for ETD)
    - Provide more flexibility with time commitments

- Match the offer monetarily or in research funds
- Support faculty research through funding, seed monies, time, and other resources

2. *Tenure Review*: Faculty member is on track for tenure by their 7th year review meeting.

- Leading up to this review, faculty members would have been well informed of the expectations and requirements needed to attain tenure status, and feel prepared and supported throughout the process
- Throughout the review Department Chairs should monitor the decision-making processes to ensure that the department is considering and valuing diverse faculty contributions and checking for any unintentional biases
- Department Chairs should keep in mind that the process of tenure review is concerned with both the qualities of the nominee and the potential impact of the proposed appointment on the department
- Department Chairs should be conscious of any legacies of exclusion that exist within their departments and monitor faculty progress with an eye of equity; namely, departments should ask if female and underrepresented minorities are being adequately guided and supported through the tenure and promotion processes. Studies suggest that while women are earning more doctorates, when it comes to professorship many women seem to hit a glass ceiling. (Lindquist et. al, 2016)

3. *Preparing for Sabbatical/leave*: Faculty member requests time off from teaching responsibilities to focus on research and family

- Sabbaticals can be presented as an opportunity for faculty members to pursue their professional interests and step down from teaching and service commitments
- Inform faculty that they will have the institutional support they might need to pursue their interests
- Consider faculty time spent on administrative tasks, particularly the “invisible labor” ([Matthew, 2016](#)) that many faculty members from underrepresented groups take on, when evaluating a faculty member’s eligibility for sabbatical
- Department Chairs should ensure that deadlines, and policies regarding sabbaticals are clear to all faculty member who are due for sabbatical
- Department Chairs should consider offering faculty regular updates on what is going on while the faculty member is gone
- Once tenured, faculty should be supported and properly trained to help them think and plan their sabbaticals so when the time comes, faculty feel prepared to take a leave to pursue their intellectual or professional development interests

## INDICATORS OF SUCCESS TABLE

The practices are organized by activity and indicators of success to help orient Department Chairs as they implement these strategies. This document defines “metrics of success” as a measure used to gauge performance. Department Chairs can use these metrics to develop targets to mark their progress towards creating an inclusive culture that promotes faculty retention. Setting benchmarks serve to measure progress over time, and keep departments accountable for retention efforts. Parker (2006) suggests that benchmarks can be set by monitoring change over time, comparisons to peer institutions or departments, and by tracking opportunities for promotions, rewards, and leadership to monitor who gets those opportunities and check for any disparities.

| Category                            | Activity  | Indicators of Success   | Tool                                     |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Department<br>Health and<br>Welfare | State of the department reviews (bi-annual)                   | Reviews show an equitable distribution of resources.<br>All faculty regardless of gender, race or ethnicity is being compensated commensurately to their performance. | Internal reviews                         |
|                                     | Exit interviews of faculty leaving Columbia                   | Over time, there are fewer “exits” from departments   | Exit interview transcripts               |
|                                     | Bi-annual surveys measuring job satisfaction and expectations | Faculty report feeling heard, valued and supported<br>Faculty respond to surveys  | Survey                                   |
|                                     | Check for workload distribution                               | Faculty report having a balanced workload   | Internal review and one-on-one check-ins |

|                        |   |  |                                 |
|------------------------|---|--|---------------------------------|
|                        | Monitor decision making processes; departmental climate and culture                 | Decision processes are recorded and reviewed regularly   | Internal review                 |
| Culture and Climate    | Transparency in policies and expectations   | Faculty accounts of awareness and knowledge of policies and expectations   | Survey                          |
|                        | Mentoring   | Number of mentoring relationships available in a department<br><br>Faculty accounts of mentoring quality                                       | Survey and internal review      |
|                        | Networking opportunities  | Number of opportunities available to faculty to meet and network with other faculty in a year  | Survey                          |
|                        | Flexible and accommodating policies   | Faculty accounts of department responsiveness to their particular needs  | Survey and one-on-one check-ins |
| Leadership Development | Opportunities to develop leadership skills and participate in department governance | Faculty accounts of opportunities for leadership development   | Survey                          |
|                        | Develop cultural competency skills in department leaders                            | Number of professional development trainings and opportunities pertaining to cultural competency available to faculty of all levels every year | Internal review                 |

|                          |   |  |                 |
|--------------------------|---|--|-----------------|
| Professional Development | Workshops and trainings                 | Number of professional development trainings and opportunities available to faculty every year | Internal review |
|                          | Grants and funding                      | Number of grants available to faculty  | Internal review |
|                          | Administrative and technical assistance | Faculty accounts of amount of administrative support they receive in a year                    | Survey          |

**BARRIERS TO RETENTION TABLE**

| Barrier to Retention               | Retention Strategy  |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Racial/Gender Isolation            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Create networking opportunities</li> <li>● Affinity Groups</li> <li>● Express commitment to diversity initiatives in word and deed</li> </ul>  |
| Lack of Mentoring                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Establish mentoring structures</li> <li>● Department Chairs also act as mentors</li> <li>● Create opportunities for faculty to meet and interact</li> </ul>  |
| Occupational Stress                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Check for workload balances</li> <li>● Provide adequate support to faculty by way of time, resources, administrative and technical support</li> <li>● Consider costs of living in New York City when creating compensation packages</li> </ul> |
| Devaluation of “Minority” Research | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● “Minority” indicates any field of research or study pertaining to issues that affect or interest a small</li> </ul>  |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>group of people, traditionally underrepresented in scholarship (Turner, Myles, &amp; Creswell, 1999)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Recognize and Reward different fields of work</li> </ul> |
| “Token” Hire Misconception               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provide professional development to all faculty on cultural sensitivity</li> <li>● Establish flexible and accommodating policies</li> </ul>                          |
| Biases in Tenure and Promotion Practices | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Make tenure and promotion policies and expectations clear and readily available to all faculty</li> <li>● Monitor decision-making processes</li> </ul>               |

The following two tables list the retention practices by faculty career stage, and campus resources that address the particular needs of faculty at different career stages. The tables also include information that is pertinent to underrepresented faculty.

| Retention Practices  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| Junior Faculty   |  |  |
| Barriers to Retention: Feeling isolated; lack of mentoring; difficulty acclimating to new environment  |  |  |
| Culture and Climate  | Leadership Development   | Professional Development   |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provide faculty with networking opportunities</li> <li>● Establish mentoring relationships between junior and senior faculty</li> <li>● Inform faculty of all policies, expectations and resources available to them</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Department Chairs should prepare to adequately mentor, support and work with faculty</li> <li>● Provide faculty with opportunities to participate in committees, national conferences, and department governance</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Guide faculty through the processes of establishing their research, hiring and managing research assistants, running research labs, mentoring students, and navigating the university.</li> </ul> |

| Recently Tenured Faculty  |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| Barriers to Retention: workload balance; biases in tenure and promotion practices; limited time for research  |   |  |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Inform faculty of all policies, and expectations pertaining to tenure and promotion policies</li> <li>● Recognize and value diverse forms of scholarship</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Offer faculty opportunities to participate in committees, national conferences, and department governance</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provide faculty with opportunities to be creative, and support faculty in the form of funding, time for research, and mentors</li> <li>● Nominate faculty for awards in recognition of outstanding performance</li> </ul> |
| Senior Tenured Faculty  |   |  |
| Barriers to Retention: Occupational stress; workload balance; limited opportunities to expand research or obtain higher positions; pull from other institutions   |   |  |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Support faculty through this transition</li> <li>● Encourage faculty to pursue their intellectual interests</li> <li>● Monitor their service and teaching commitments allowing faculty to cut back on some duties</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provide leadership training opportunities for senior faculty as a key pathway to enhancing academic governance</li> <li>● Train faculty on cultural sensitivity, being an ally, and sustaining an inclusive climate</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Facilitate targeted professional training and development for faculty</li> </ul>  |
| Underrepresented Faculty  |   |  |
| Barriers to Retention: Racial and gender isolation; feeling like the “token” hire; devaluation of diverse research and scholarship; “minority tax” for uneven service burden  |   |  |

|  |  |   |
|--|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Establish flexible and accommodating policies for faculty to meet their diverse needs adequately</li><li>● Monitor decision-making processes to check for any implicit biases</li><li>● Connect faculty to affinity groups and other resources on and off campus</li><li>● Create mentoring structures for faculty</li><li>● Check for behaviors or norms in the department that may create a hostile or unwelcoming environment for faculty members</li></ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Train Department Chairs and all faculty on being culturally sensitive and responsive</li><li>● Offer faculty opportunities to participate in committees, national conferences, and department governance</li></ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Ensure that underrepresented minorities are not overburdened with responsibilities of being the “token” member of an underrepresented group</li><li>● Nominate faculty for awards in recognition of outstanding performance</li></ul> |
|--|--|---|

## Campus Resources

### For Junior Faculty:

- The Columbia Center for Teaching and Learning (CTL) offers a number of ways for faculty to stay connected and build community on campus
- Provost's Grant Program for Junior Faculty Who Contribute to the Diversity Goals of the University
- The Lenfest Junior Faculty Development Grants were established in 2015 to provide additional financial support to junior faculty to help complete projects to meet the expectations for tenure

### For Recently tenured Faculty:

- Several research funding opportunities across campus to support and encourage faculty at this stage to pursue their intellectual interests
- Data Science Institute
- Office of the Executive Vice President for Research
- CTL partners with faculty who have been awarded grants to innovate in their classroom or online environments to support faculty in bringing their projects to fruition

### For Senior Faculty:

- Office of the Provost has established the Provost Leadership Fellows Program. The Fellows Program aims to develop leadership skills for some of our outstanding tenured faculty
- The Columbia University Medical Center (CUMC) Summer Institute for Teaching and Learning is a one-day workshop for junior faculty or senior faculty who have taken on a new teaching role

### For underrepresented faculty:

- The Earth Institute NSF ADVANCE Program provides funding for women scientists, departments and research centers

## LITERATURE REVIEW

- August, Louise, and J. Waltman. "Culture, Climate, and Contribution: Career Satisfaction Among Female Faculty." *Research in Higher Education* 45, no. 2 (2004): 177-192.
- Brent, Rebecca. *Retaining Diverse Department Faculties: A Guide for Department Heads*. Cary: North Carolina State University, 2014. Print.
- "Faculty Recruitment and Retention Toolkit". San Diego: University of San Diego, 2012. Print.
- "Faculty Recruitment and Retention." Office for Inclusion and Equity. University of Texas at Austin, [equity.utexas.edu/faculty-recruitment-and-retention/](http://equity.utexas.edu/faculty-recruitment-and-retention/). Accessed 12 Oct. 2016.
- "Faculty Retention and Exit Survey." The Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education. Harvard Graduate School of Education, [coache.gse.harvard.edu/faculty-retention-and-exit-survey](http://coache.gse.harvard.edu/faculty-retention-and-exit-survey). Accessed 12 Oct. 2016.
- "Faculty Retention Toolkit for the College of Engineering and the College of Arts & Sciences," Seattle: ADVANCE Center for Institutional Change, 2016. Print.
- "Faculty Retention & Work/Life." ADVANCE Center for Institutional Change. University of Washington, Mar. 2014, [advance.washington.edu/resources/facretention.html](http://advance.washington.edu/resources/facretention.html). Accessed 12 Oct. 2016.
- Gasman, Marybeth, J. Kim, T. Nguyen. "Effectively Recruiting Faculty of Color at Highly Selective Institutions: A School of Education Case Study," *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 4, no. 4 (2011): 212-222.
- "Inclusive Retention Toolkit: For Faculty, Graduate Students, and Postdoctoral Fellows," Austin: The University of Texas at Austin, Division of Diversity and Community Engagement, 2015. Print.
- King, Derenda. and, A. Robinson-Armstrong. "Faculty Retention Toolkit." 12 Nov. 2008, PowerPoint File.
- Misra, Joya, Hickes Lundquist, Jennifer, Holmes, Elissa, & Agiomavritis, Stephanie. (2011). The Ivory ceiling of service work: service work continues to pull women associate professors away from research. What can be done? *Academe*. 97(1).
- Monaghan, Peter. "Helping Professors Overcome Midcareer Malaise." *The Chronicle of Higher Education* (2017): n. pag. Web. 9 May 2017.
- Museus, S. D., Ledesma, M. C. and Parker, T. L. (2015), Racism and Racial Equity in Higher Education. ASHE High. Edu. Rept., 42: 1–112. doi:10.1002/aehe.20067

"Retention Guidelines." Vice Provost for Faculty Development and Diversity. Stanford University, [facultydevelopment.stanford.edu/retention-guidelines](http://facultydevelopment.stanford.edu/retention-guidelines). Accessed 12 Oct. 2016.

Rockquemore, Kerry Ann. "How to Retain a Diverse Faculty," *Inside Higher Ed*, 6 Jan. 2016, [www.insidehighered.com/advice/2016/01/06/how-retain-diverse-faculty-essay](http://www.insidehighered.com/advice/2016/01/06/how-retain-diverse-faculty-essay). Accessed 12 Oct. 2016.

Rosser, Vicki J. "Faculty Members' Intentions to Leave: A National Study on Their Worklife and Satisfaction," *Research in Higher Ed* 45, no.3 (2004): 285-309.

DRAFT